

Kingston Conservation Advisory Council Monthly Meeting: Special Presentation City Hall Common Council Chambers Date: October 14, 2014 6:30pm

Call to Order: 6:32 pm

Board Members: Julie Noble (Chair), Diane Bonavita, Emilie Hauser, Lynn Johnson,

Kevin McEvoy (Secretary), Casey Schwarz, Gregg Swanzey

Guests

Jolanda Jansen, League of Women Voters Judith Hansen, Superintendent Kingston Water Dept. Approximately 250 members of the public

Introduction – Julie Noble, CAC Chair, presented an introduction to the meeting, including but not limited to, introduction of the council members and description of the agenda as including an overview of the Kingston Water Supply and Distribution System by the Water Superintendent followed by a presentation of the details of the Niagara Bottling proposal as it pertains to the City of Kingston followed in turn by a question and answer between the CAC and the Superintendent and by a public question and answer period moderated by Jolanda Jansen, a member of League of Women Voters Mid-Hudson Region pursuant to "ground rules" (attached as "Appendix A" hereinafter) that included submission of questions on index cards.

Julie followed by describing the history, mission and scope of the Kingston CAC and a short list of accomplishments and activity including but not limited to the Climate Action Plan, and the Climate Smart Communities and Green Jobs Pledge and mentioning that Kingston is a bronze level Climate Smart Community.

Jolanda Jansen of the League of Woman Voters was introduced at approximately 6:42, She indicated that while many public questions appear not to be duplicated, not all answers can be answered and that signs may be displayed but no direct questions from the public concerning the presentation are permitted as per the aforementioned "ground rules".

Special Presentation: At approximately 6:45 PM Judith Hansen, Superintendent Kingston Water Department was introduced and began an Overview of the Kingston Water Supply and Distribution System followed by an explanation of the Niagara Bottling proposal. Link to the presentation is at "Appendix B" hereafter. At approximately 7:42 PM the presentation concluded.

Immediately thereafter, the CAC members then asked various questions, including but not limited to, (a) the membership of the water board (see Water Board webpage for members: http://kingston-ny.gov/content/76/78/1005/default.aspx), (b) benefits of the Niagara project for the rate payers, water demand and capacity including maximum yield, (c) Water Dept contract specifications and procedures, (d) SEQRA status, (e) public trust doctrine, (f) consideration of Climate Action Plan and the Climate Smart and Green Jobs Community Pledge.

Superintendant Hansen answered the questions, however she could not answer questions pertaining to legal matters including indicating that she had no knowledge concerning the public trust doctrine and that it was not reviewed by the Water Board, or matters pertaining to or within the scope of SEQRA. She indicated the Water Board has not reviewed the Kingston Climate Action Plan or the Climate Smart and Green Jobs Community Pledge as of date.

At approximately 8:08PM, Jolanda Jansen began reading summaries of questions submitted on index cards by public members attending the meeting. When applicable, duplicative questions were combined. Superintendent Hansen responded to questions-

At approximately 9:02, the question and answer period ended. Jolanda gave concluding remarks, including but not limited to, stating that the CAC would continue discussion without public questions or comments to which Julie added that the CAC would continue to accept written questions on the index cards or by email.

See link to questions at "Appendix C" hereinafter.

Motions on Next Steps: During the discussion session, Julie submitted two motions to the council.

1. The first motion was to form an ad hoc water bottling committee to gather information on the water bottling project which motion was passed with six council members voting in favor and one abstention. As an action item Diane, Julie, Gregg and Kevin agreed to serve on the Ad Hoc committee.

2. The second motion was as follows:

Upon taking these comments into consideration, along with review of the SEQR process, the Kingston Conservation Advisory Council would like to recommend to the City of Kingston Common Council and the Mayor of the City that the City of Kingston should recommend that the NYS Department of Environmental Conservation (DEC) would serve best as Lead Agency under SEQRA for the Niagara Bottling Proposal. Informing our recommendations for this consideration include the following concerns:

- The multi-jurisdictional nature of this proposal, with economic and environmental impacts on the City of Kingston, the Town of Ulster, and the Town of Woodstock
- The DEC's permitting oversight through the SPDES program

- The sensitivity of the impact on the Lower Esopus Creek particularly regarding its listing under Section 303(d) of the Federal Clean Water Act (CWA)
- The greenhouse gas emissions and traffic impact on local municipalities
- The principle of the sustainability of the use of fossil fuels in processing and bottling water for consumption

Following discussion on the motion, the motion passed with four in favor with three abstentions.

Adjournment: At 10:12PM Gregg made a motion to adjourn, seconded by Casey which motion was unanimously approved.

Appendix A

Ground Rules for October 14th, CAC Meeting

- A. Opportunities for public input
- a. Ask the speaker clarifying questions on the topic presented here today
- 1. Submit via the index cards provided
- b. Please fill out the feedback forms to provide comments on the meeting overall and other input
- B. Courtesy
 - 1. Please be Respectful and Courteous
 - 2. Please turn phones off
 - 3. Avoid talking while others are speaking
 - 4. Respect differences of opinion
- C. Scope of Discussion
- a. Focus on the topic
- b. We will put all issues that are not under the scope of today's meeting in a "Parking Lot"
- D. Information Capture
- a. Meeting minutes are recorded and will be posted at www.kingston-ny.gov/kingstoncac per Open Meetings Law
- b. Public meetings permit video filming and photographs. It is courteous to alert the committee if this is happening, but not required.

Appendix B: Link to Water Superintendant Presentation
http://www.kingstonny.gov/filestorage/76/6654/6656/8234/12120/presentation_to_CAC_10-14-2014 Judith Hansen Water Department.pdf

Appendix C: Link to Public Questions Submitted to the CAC concerning Niagara Bottling Proposal

http://www.kingstonny.gov/filestorage/76/6654/6656/8234/12120/Bottling_Public_Quest ions from October 14 2014 CAC meeting Final.pd